

# City Council

Monday 10 June 2013

## PRESENT:

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Mrs Pengelly, in the Chair.

The Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Churchill, Vice Chair.

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowie, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Casey, Coker, Damarell, Darcy, Philippa Davey, Sam Davey, Mrs Dolan, Drean, Evans, K Foster, Mrs Foster, Fox, Fry, Gordon, Haydon, James, Jarvis, Jordan, Martin Leaves, Michael Leaves, Sam Leaves, Lowry, Dr. Mahony, McDonald, Monahan, Murphy, Mrs Nelder, Nicholson, Mrs Nicholson, Parker, Penberthy, Rennie, Ricketts, Dr. Salter, Singh, John Smith, Peter Smith, Stark, Stevens, Jon Taylor, Kate Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Wogens, Williams and Wright.

Also in attendance: Tracey Lee (Chief Executive), Tim Howes (Assistant Director for Law, Democracy and Governance), Judith Shore (Democratic and Member Services Manager) and Nicola Kirby (Senior Democratic Support Officer (Cabinet)).

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 5.45 pm.

*Note: At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

## 10. MINUTES

Agreed the minutes of the meeting of the City Council held on 22 April (and continued on 23 April 2013) and the Annual Meeting of the City Council held on 17 May 2013.

## 11. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were made in accordance with the code of conduct from councillors in relation to items under consideration at this meeting –

Name	Item	Interest	Reason
Councillor Jordan	Minute 20 – Motion on Notice: Tackling Child Poverty	Personal	Director of Routeways
The Lord Mayor (Councillor Mrs Pengelly)	Minute 21 – Questions by Councillors (Question 23)	Personal	Involvement with Plymouth Raiders

12. **APPOINTMENTS TO COMMITTEES, OUTSIDE BODIES ETC**

Agreed –

- (1) the following appointments -

	<b>Committees and Other Bodies</b>	<b>Membership</b>	<b>Appointments 2013/14</b>
(a)	Plymouth Arts Centre	up to two observers	Cllr Jarvis Cllr Jordan
(b)	Local Government Association General Assembly	up to four representatives Current representative is Cllr Evans (five votes)	Councillor Nicholson (Deputy Leader). No further nominations were submitted by the Labour Group
(c)	Pembroke Street Estate Management Board	Resignation of Councillor Coker	Councillor Stevens

- (2) that the two vacancies arising from resignations of former Councillor Browne and Councillor Williams from the Plymouth Community Homes Board are deferred at the present time.

The following appointments of substitute members were noted -

<b>Joint Committee</b>	<b>Membership</b>
Mount Edgcombe Joint Committee	Councillor Monahan
Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee	Councillor Drear

13. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**The Lord Mayor** advised the council that on 8 May 2013, Councillor David Stark completed 50 years as an elected councillor representing Plymouth wards on Plymouth City Council and Devon County Council. On behalf of all members of the council, she congratulated him on this outstanding achievement and hoped that he would continue for many more years to come.

**Councillor Evans (Council Leader)** referred to –

- (a) the progress of the pledges made by the Labour administration;

- (b) Adam Broome (Director for Corporate Services) who was leaving the council in the summer. He thanked Adam for his work, particularly his pivotal role in the improvement of the council, and he wished him well in the future.

The Lord Mayor also wished him well and indicated that there would be further opportunities for individual councillors to express their thanks before he left.

**Councillor Coker (Cabinet Member for Transport)** gave an update on highways investment with regard to the repair of potholes, repair maintenance and the first phase of a road surfacing programme which would begin in July 2013. He also indicated that councillors would receive an email on a monthly basis informing them of progress.

**Councillor Smith (Deputy Leader)** reported on his successful recent visit to Plymouth Massachusetts (MA) as part of a delegation arranged by the Chamber of Commerce and Industry in conjunction with the Chamber in Plymouth MA which took place from 20 to 24 May 2013.

The delegation included the Head of Economy, Enterprise and Employment and representatives of the City College, the Culture Board, Plymouth University and Destination Plymouth.

As a result of the visit, the delegation identified 39 action points to be carried out all of which could bring benefits in the fields of education, skills, commerce and economic development and a written report would be made available in due course.

Councillor Smith thanked the hosts of the visit and also the Plymouth Chamber of Commerce and Industry for their work in making the visit such a success.

**Councillor Williams (Cabinet Member for Children and Young People)** referred to the outstanding performance of many of the schools in the city and reported that she was looking forward to closer links with the Plymouth School Teaching Alliance.

#### 14. **QUESTIONS BY THE PUBLIC**

Two questions had been received from members of the public in relation to matters which in the opinion of the Lord Mayor, were relevant to the business of the meeting, in accordance with paragraph 10 of the Constitution.

Mr Aldred (Q1) attended the meeting and the Councillor Penberthy responded as set out below.

<b>Question No</b>	<b>Question By</b>	<b>Cabinet Member</b>	<b>Subject</b>
Q1/13-14	Mr R Aldred	Councillor Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Cooperatives and Community Development)	'Bedroom' Tax: Reclassification by Housing Associations

Will the council be writing to the housing associations in the Plymouth area and encouraging them to reclassify their social housing as a way to properly oppose this bedroom tax as done by Leeds Council and the Knowsley Housing Trust?

**Response:**

The council has been working cooperatively and proactively for over a year with partners to look at ways to mitigate the worst impact of the Government's Welfare Reforms.

We are aware that the government's 'Bedroom' Tax is hitting our partners, their tenants and the Plymouth economy significantly. We have already been in discussions with partners around reclassification of bedrooms in some detail, and they are clear in pointing out that it is not a simple issue.

National Government has made it almost impossible to find ways to legally lessen the impact on some of our poorest families. We are aware that within the first eight weeks of the 'Bedroom' Tax, our local housing associations have seen a steep rise in rent arrears, with it affecting at least 400 households in the city.

Unfortunately the argument around reclassification is not simple and while the impact on councils who own their stock is minimal, housing associations have least room to manoeuvre. They have said that the main impacts would be:

- a loss of income as they would be required by law to cut their rents;
- a potential reclassification of premises impacted by the 'Bedroom' Tax would lead to different rent charges being applied to identical properties based solely on who is paying the bill, a clearly unfair situation;
- a potential reclassification of all identical properties where any are impacted by the 'Bedroom' Tax would lead to an immediate increase in overcrowded properties exacerbating the current situation, a course of action which neither they nor we would want to take;
- financial viability as accommodation size is an important part of their housing stock value; this value is used to lever operating capital, improvement works and new housing developments.

As part of our on-going work with our local housing associations, I have already written to them to ask them to consider reclassification.

We will continue to support and work proactively with our partners to find ways of mitigating the impact of the government's 'Bedroom' Tax.

In the absence of the questioner for Q2, a written response would be sent to Mr Taylor-Wickenden as set out below.

<b>Question No</b>	<b>Question By</b>	<b>Cabinet Member</b>	<b>Subject</b>
Q2/13-14	Mr Samuel Taylor-Wickenden	Councillor Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance)	Debts from non-payment of Council Tax
<p>What will it cost for Plymouth City Council to hire bailiffs against those who accrue debts from non-payment of Council Tax? Won't this increase rather than decrease the levels of poverty seen within Plymouth?</p>			
<p><b>Response:</b></p> <p>There are no costs to Plymouth City Council for the use of contracted bailiffs. Bailiffs recoup their costs by way of fees to the customer and Plymouth's bailiffs have some of the lowest charges.</p> <p>Any bailiff activity is undertaken as a last resort and once all other avenues to collect outstanding arrears have been exhausted. In the majority of cases collection to arrears is carried out by other means such as direct from earnings or benefits, or by an agreed payment plan.</p> <p>Only a small proportion of cases are sent to the bailiff (around two per cent of arrears cases) and any cases that are deemed to be vulnerable or unsuitable for collection by the bailiff will not be referred, or will be recalled if details are found after the case has gone to the bailiff.</p> <p>Customer costs to the bailiff will vary depending on the size of the arrears and the level of interaction required by the bailiff to recover them.</p> <p>Plymouth aims to encourage customers to contact us as soon as possible if payments cannot be met in order that we can discuss options with the customer and avoid additional costs wherever possible.</p>			

15. **COMMUNITY ASSET TRANSFER POLICY**

Councillor Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Cooperatives and Community Development) presented the Cabinet recommendation for approval and Councillor Evans (Council Leader) seconded the proposal (Cabinet minute 6 referred).

Councillors expressed the need for clear management agreements, sustainability for the management arrangements and to ensure that usage was inclusive for all of the community.

Agreed to adopt the newly drafted Community Asset Transfer Policy.

16. **FINANCIAL OUTTURN 2012/13 (INCLUDING CAPITAL PROGRAMME UPDATE)**

Councillor Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) presented the Cabinet recommendations for approval and Councillor Kate Taylor seconded the proposals (Cabinet minute 9 referred).

Councillor Lowry was asked to declare a delivery target for the capital programme. Attention was also drawn to a disparity in the recommendations in different sections of the written report and the Cabinet recommendations, relating to a transfer to the redundancy or pension fund in recommendation (2).

Agreed –

- (1) that the provisional outturn position as at 31 March 2013 is noted;
- (2) the additional transfers to reserves reflected in the outturn figures -
  - transfer to Plymouth Life Centre Dowry for 2012/13; £0.150m
  - transfer to Pensions Reserve; £0.150m
  - transfer to General Reserve for community economic development trust development; £0.050m
- (3) that the adjusted revenue deficit for the year of £0.504m is noted and approval is given to the deficit being met by a transfer from the General Fund Working Balance;
- (4) the following net nil transfers between reserves and provisions:
  - creation of a Transformational Change Reserve £0.250m
  - transfer to Plymouth Life Centre Dowry (2013/14) £0.150m
  - transfer to Pension Reserve; £0.600m
  - net reduction to Insurance Provision and Reserves £(0.394)m
  - reduce VAT repayment reserve £(0.185)m
  - reduce Icelandic Bank legal reserve £(0.164)m
  - reduce Housing Rents provision £(0.171)m
  - reduce general commuted maintenance reserve £(0.086)m
- (5) that the capital financing requirement of £46.504m is noted and approval is given to the borrowing requirement of £4.806m for 2012/13;
- (6) the additional use of capital receipts totalling £0.840m and increasing the revenue Investment Fund Reserve by the same amount;

- (7) that the re-profiling changes to the capital programme identified during the outturn process subsequent to council approval in February 2013 are noted and approval is given to the latest revised forecasts totalling £122.670m for 2013/14 – 2015/16 which also include new approvals since February 2013 as set out in Table 5 in the report.

## 17. **LANGAGE EMPLOYMENT UNITS**

Councillor Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) presented the Cabinet recommendation and Councillor Evans (Council Leader) seconded the proposal (Cabinet minute 7a referred).

Following concerns expressed by ward councillors with regard to current parking issues, Councillor Lowry undertook to ensure that appropriate travel plans would be in place in relation to future developments and that car parking provision would be made where appropriate.

Agreed to amend the capital programme to include £2.5m for a scheme to provide 2,787 square feet of industrial workspace at Langage.

## 18. **SCRUTINY TERMS OF REFERENCE**

Councillor James (Chair of the Cooperative Scrutiny Board) presented the Cooperative Scrutiny Board's recommendations (Cooperative Scrutiny Board minute 4 and the proposed updated terms of reference referred), together with a proposal to add two additional recommendations in the light of comments by OFSTED in relation to splitting responsibility for scrutiny of children's services and a drafting amendment, as follows -

- (7) to add 'welfare reform' to the terms of reference of the Cooperative Scrutiny Board;
- (8) to amend the Partnership Links in the terms of reference for the Caring Plymouth panel where Children's Partnership (for social care matters) should read Children's Partnership (for health matters) and the link in the Ambitious Plymouth panel where Children's Partnership (for education matters) should read Children's Partnership (for social care and education matters).

Councillor Stark seconded the proposals, as amended.

Agreed the amendments to the terms of reference of the Cooperative Scrutiny Board and the scrutiny panels as follows -

- (1) move Human Resources and ICT to the terms of reference for the Co-operative Scrutiny Board;
- (2) evidence a link between 'Working Plymouth' and 'Ambitious Plymouth' with respect to 'apprenticeships';

- (3) move Children's social care, adoption and fostering, early intervention and prevention, corporate parenting and the leadership and delivery of all services for children and young people out of the terms of reference for 'Caring Plymouth' and into the terms of reference for 'Ambitious Plymouth';
- (4) to amend the wording of the terms of reference for Caring Plymouth from 'Adult and Children's Health and Social Care' to Adult and Children's Health' to reflect (3) above;
- (5) add 'customer services' to the terms of reference for 'Your Plymouth';
- (6) update the 'corporate plan priorities' section of all terms of reference as and when the draft corporate plan is approved by City Council;
- (7) to add 'welfare reform' to the terms of reference of the Cooperative Scrutiny Board;
- (8) to amend the Partnership Links in the terms of reference for the Caring Plymouth panel where Children's Partnership (for social care matters) should read Children's Partnership (for health matters) and the link in the Ambitious Plymouth panel where Children's Partnership (for education matters) should read Children's Partnership (for social care and education matters).

19. **ANNUAL SCRUTINY REPORT 2012/13**

Councillor James (Chair of the Cooperative Scrutiny Board) presented the Annual Scrutiny Report 2012/13 and thanked the officers for their support. He also paid tribute to Councillor Mrs Aspinall (former Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Commission) for her work during the past year and made particular reference to her cross party working.

Councillor Mrs Aspinall also thanked everyone who had supported her in her role.

The report was noted.

**MOTION ON NOTICE**

20. **Tackling Child Poverty**

Councillor Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Cooperatives and Community Development) moved and Councillor Mrs Bowyer seconded the following motion -

**'TACKLING CHILD POVERTY**

Child poverty is essentially a result of poverty in families.

Child poverty matters because it means children suffer now and their future lives can be blighted.

Income is central to the lives of all families in poverty. This reflects the current national measure which classes families earning less than £251 per week as living in poverty. In Plymouth this equates to 11,560 children, of which 10,190 are aged under 16<sup>1</sup>.

Amidst the deepening economic crisis, it is an opportune time to develop our local plan to tackle child poverty. Falling incomes, unemployment, rising cost of living, reduced economic activity and major changes to the way that welfare assistance is provided are having a real impact on Plymouth families both in the short and long term. For example, stressors such as job loss, home foreclosure, or loss in family savings can place strain on parental relationships and on the family as a whole. It can affect educational achievement of children by reducing families' abilities to provide a supportive learning environment or adequate nutrition, or by forcing a delay or abandonment of higher education plans.

Plymouth has shaped its response to child poverty based on its understanding of child poverty as the outcome of economic, environmental and social factors that can damage a child's development and limit or prevent children and young people from having many of the experiences and opportunities that others take for granted<sup>2</sup>.

Our three year strategy presents how Plymouth aims to tackle the causes and impact of child poverty, while also acknowledging the limits and challenges presented by the current economic and social environment.

Council therefore:

- (1) commends the Cross Party Working Group on Child Poverty, our partners, officers, Youth Council, the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Cabinet for their cooperation in developing a new Child Poverty Strategy for the city;
- (2) commits to encourage partners to work with us to deliver the Child Poverty Strategy and action plan;
- (3) will actively support and promote the work of the new Standing Conference on Child Poverty;
- (4) instructs officers to share all background information, consultation responses and thinking from the last two years of work in developing the Child Poverty Strategy and action plan with the Plymouth Fairness Commission;
- (5) encourages members to act as Child Poverty Champions within their wards; working to mitigate the impact of child poverty now and take action to stop future generations lives being blighted by child poverty.'

---

<sup>1</sup> Based on HMRC definition (Number of children in families in receipt of either out of work (means-tested) benefits, or in receipt of tax credits where their reported income is less than 60 per cent of median income. Snapshot at 31 August 2010.

<sup>2</sup> Definition taken from the Plymouth Children and Young People's Plan 2011-2014

During the debate, the issues raised (in addition to those stated in the motion) were –

- (a) the DVD viewed by councillors before the council meeting, which had been made by young people and showed what living in child poverty meant for them. The DVD and the action plan would be available on the website, the following day;
- (b) actions which could be taken to minimise the impact of child poverty including –
  - the review of retail and shopping provision in areas of child poverty as part of the Plymouth plan;
  - budgeting sessions at schools;
  - encouraging self-confidence, particularly at schools;
  - promoting inclusiveness at schools having regard to affordability (for example with proms);
  - tackling poverty in families;
- (c) the potential crime and social problems arising from poverty;
- (d) that a report on the living wage paper would be considered at the next meeting of the City Council on 22 July 2013;
- (e) in some wards, young people in poverty were concentrated in particular sectors and in some cases were hidden.

During the debate, the Lord Mayor advised councillors in relation to comments on the DVD.

Agreed that the City Council -

- (1) commends the Cross Party Working Group on Child Poverty, the council's partners, officers, Youth Council, the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Cabinet for their cooperation in developing a new Child Poverty Strategy for the city;
- (2) commits to encourage partners to work with the City Council to deliver the Child Poverty Strategy and action plan;
- (3) will actively support and promote the work of the new Standing Conference on Child Poverty;
- (4) instructs officers to share all background information, consultation responses and thinking from the last two years of work in developing the Child Poverty Strategy and action plan with the Plymouth Fairness Commission;
- (5) encourages members to act as Child Poverty Champions within their wards; working to mitigate the impact of child poverty now and take action to stop future generations lives being blighted by child poverty.

(Councillor Jordan declared a personal interest in the above item.)

## 21. QUESTIONS BY COUNCILLORS

In accordance with paragraph 12 of the constitution, the following questions were asked of the Leader, Cabinet Members and Committee Chairs covering aspects of their areas of responsibility -

	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>	<b>Subject</b>
1	Councillor Ball	Councillor Coker	Would he agree that the current levels of noise and air pollution were excessive on the A38 Parkway and was exacerbated by the Highways Agency reducing vegetation? Would he press the agency to undertake noise and air pollution tests?
	Councillor Coker had made representations to the Highways Agency and would press the agency to undertake tests. He also asked that Councillor Ball and he lobby Oliver Colville MP and Alison Seabeck MP.		
2	Councillor Sam Leaves	Councillor Williams	When would she sign off funding for the replacement of boilers at Knowle Primary School?
	Councillor Williams indicated that it was currently being looked at and she would forward the details to her.		
3	Councillor Jordan	Councillor Vincent	Would the city be participating in Prince Charles' initiative to commemorate the 60 <sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Queen's coronation with a coronation meadow or any other commemorative events?
	Councillor Vincent indicated that he would raise the coronation meadow with the officers.		
4	Councillor Dr Salter	Councillors Coker and Evans	Was there any progress made on rail connectivity when Patrick McLoughlin (Secretary of State for Transport) came to Plymouth or any future plans? Should the Council do something more visible?
	Councillors Coker and Evans responded that the council had not been invited to attend the visit. Progress was being made. The council had the Spine Report and there was also another report being produced by officers. The Chief Executive had been also working with a peninsula task force.		
5	Councillor Singh	Councillor Coker	How long would the improvements at the railway station take and would notifications be published in the press?
	Councillor Coker responded that the work would be completed before the Christmas shopping rush. Information would be published on the website and businesses and residences would be notified in the usual manner.		

6	Councillor Nicholson	Councillor Vincent	Why was the council slow to act to remove the gypsy encampment at Horsham Field and would he review the policy and its implementation, and report back in due course?
	Councillor Vincent responded that the delay was as a result of the Bank Holiday at the end of May 2013. The process relied on court availability and the site was cleared as soon as practical. The policy had been reviewed when this process commenced.		
7	Councillor Mrs Beer	Councillor Peter Smith	A message left with the call centre concerning an overflowing waste bin, had not been passed to the department concerned and Councillor Smith was asked to find out why.
	Councillor Smith responded that if Councillor Mrs Beer sent him the relevant information, he would ensure that she received a response.		
8	Councillor Parker	Councillor Penberthy	Did he think that the scheme to provide cheaper energy in Plymouth and create employment was a positive step?
	Councillor Penberthy responded that a £50m eco investment in the city, announced by British Gas was a positive step. Plymouth Community Homes were also receiving monies to invest in their stock. An announcement would be made in July 2013, including a new energy cooperative.		
9	Councillor Martin Leaves	Councillor Penberthy	Could he confirm the number of city households which were under and over occupied?
	Councillor Penberthy provided figures that came from many different sources and he indicated that he was working with 24 housing associations. The figures demonstrated a need for more one bed roomed flats.		
10	Councillor Bowyer	Councillor McDonald	What steps were being taken to avoid an overspend on the adult social care budget this year?
	Councillor McDonald responded that she would not be spending £3m on organisational change as had been done previously. The measures included the transformation agenda to support people in their own homes; a single system to manage the personalisation agenda; realistic targets for sickness and absence and emergency plans for carers.		
11	Councillor Stark	Councillor Williams	How much of the £50m allocated for summer schools had been allocated to Plymouth and how was the money to be allocated?
	Councillor Williams replied that a written response would be provided.		

12	Councillor Wigans	Councillor Vincent	What actual steps were being taken to speed up the eviction process for Gypsies and Travellers? Could he furnish the Plymstock Dunstone ward councillors with the updated process so that they could advise residents?
	Councillor Vincent responded that Councillor Penberthy was leading on this issue. The process was being updated and when available, the information would be sent to all councillors.		
13	Councillor Fry	Councillor Peter Smith	Could he provide all councillors with a copy of the report given today on his visit to Plymouth Massachusetts? He also asked for a list of those who had attended the visit and the group that they were representing.
	Councillor Smith gave an assurance that Councillor Fry would be provided with a comprehensive report on the visit being prepared by both Chambers of Commerce and Industry (which would include the content of the speech).		
14	Councillor Foster	Councillor Vincent	Why could other councils carry out evictions more quickly? He was told that evictions by South Hams Council could be undertaken in three days.
	Councillor Vincent responded that he was following the procedure in place. The matter was being addressed by Councillor Penberthy.		
15	Councillor Bowyer	Councillor Vincent	Would he review the future use of pitches to ensure that designated parking was in place? When would a review be carried out and would it be in place for next season?
	Councillor Vincent responded that he was aware of the parking issue and had spoken with the Parks Department who were doing as much as possible to alleviate the position but that there was not an immediate solution. He could not promise that a review would be in place by next season but it was hoped that litter would be reduced and users would be encouraged to show more consideration to residents.		
16	Councillor Michael Leaves	Councillor Vincent	Following the announcement of substantial government support for the Sherford development, could an update be given on the swimming pool for Plymstock and could he give an assurance that the swimming pool was a priority?
	Councillor Vincent responded that the swimming pool would be included at the planning stage and had been agreed as part of the Section 106 agreement on the site.		
17	Councillor James	Councillor Williams	How many young carers were there in the city and how did she obtain the information? What support would be provided?

	<p>Councillor Williams responded that the information had been gathered from a questionnaire completed by schools. Whilst it showed an enormous number she remained unconvinced that it was the actual number of young carers. Staff were being trained so that information could be gathered on home visits which would enable resources to be targeted at those with high needs. Support was also given through the youth service and in other ways as there was a huge age range involved.</p>		
18	Councillor Darcy	Councillor Coker	<p>Could he clarify whether a camera car could be used in the suburbs, for traffic management issues?</p>
<p>Councillor Coker responded 'yes'.</p>			
19	Councillor Stevens	Councillor Peter Smith	<p>Councillor Jordan referred to the lack of events to commemorate the Queen's Jubilee. As the change of administration was only three weeks before the event, who had been the Cabinet Member previously and how long did such events take to plan?</p>
<p>Councillor Smith responded that events would take months to plan and that Councillor Jordan had been the Cabinet Member responsible at the time.</p>			
20	Councillor Sam Leaves	Councillor Coker	<p>In the interests of child safety, should all schools not have a 20mph speed limit outside of schools? When could she see plans?</p>
<p>Councillor Coker responded that he had signed up to the national initiative for 20 mph schemes although it was difficult with the costs involved. Monies for safer journeys to schools would be delegated to ward councillors so that they could prioritise decisions and the money could be used for this purpose if they wished.</p>			
21	Councillor Nicholson	Councillor Penberthy	<p>How did he see a solution to the unauthorised occupation of land at Billacombe by horses? What attempts were being made to monitor the site to try and identify a guardian?</p>
<p>Councillor Penberthy indicated the process and costs for the movement of animals. Officers were visiting at different times during the day to try and identify those responsible. As officer time was limited, residents were asked to assist if possible.</p>			
22	Councillor Mrs Beer	Councillor Vincent	<p>Why were the bins in play parks not emptied first thing on a Monday morning? They were not emptied in Plympton St Mary after this weekend.</p>
<p>Councillor Vincent replied that he had responded to her emails on the issue and that larger bins could be provided where there was greater usage.</p>			

23	Councillor Jordan	Councillor Peter Smith	If the council was withdrawing funding from events and sport, including Plymouth Raiders, how was it going promote healthy living, particularly through school and healthy activities.
<p>Councillor Smith responded that the budget previously used to assist the Plymouth Raiders was no longer available as funding was being allocated direct to schools by the government. The funding was being phased out over a four year period. Councillors were advised that they could lobby the government on the allocation of funding direct to schools.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><u>(The Lord Mayor declared a personal interest in the above question.)</u></p>			

*Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.*